

ATTACHMENT 4

INITIAL LITERATURE REVIEW

CHILD CARE STUDY 2022

GENERAL INSIGHTS ON THE ISSUE OF CHILD CARE ISSUE

1. "The Future of Early Childhood Education After Covid-19."

YouTube, uploaded by Brookings, 18 Aug. 2021, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=n4Xblvp8UeA>

- This was an event of The Brown Center of Education Policy at Brookings. Three experts in Early Childhood Education Policy were asked questions by a moderator from Brookings. A lot of information was covered with the following highlights:
- ECE is in a tough spot right now. Problems include: program instability, learning setbacks for young children, working conditions for teachers and high teacher turnover.
- The American Rescue Plan has helped families and child care programs during the pandemic. Government support has included providing immediate cash assistance to programs and providing health guidance.
- As a nation we have never invested in building a high quality ECE system. Those who work in child care don't have good working conditions or wages.
- High quality care can be a very good investment for government. The challenge is that those programs need to be quality and equitable.
- We need to use the equity view. Race, income and zip code currently indicates whether a child has access to better care. We must focus on children who have the most needs right now.
- However, all families need more support for child care.
- The Biden administration has made support for families and investment in early childhood a priority.
- As we move forward, public/private partnerships need to be part of the plan.
- Governance – At the local, state and federal level, we need to speak with one voice about health, safety and learning. – whether that's for family day homes, Head Start, licensed child care programs, faith based or public school.

2. The White House, FACT SHEET: President Biden’s Build Back Better Agenda Will Deliver Historic Investments in American Families and Communities, 13 Aug. 2021,

<https://www.whitehouse.gov/briefing-room/statements-releases/2021/08/13/fact-sheet-president-bidens-build-back-better-agenda-will-deliver-historic-investments-in-american-families-and-communities/>

- The BBB bill offers universal and free preschool for all children, ages 3 and 4 years.
- It makes the largest investment in child care in the nation’s history, saving most American families more than half of their spending on child care.
- It provides 39 million households up to \$3,600 (or \$300 per month) in tax cuts per child by extending the American Rescue Plan’s expanded Child Tax Credit.

3. Office of the Governor, Governor Northam Announces More Children Have Access to Early Childhood Education Than Ever Before, 21 Dec. 2021,

<https://www.governor.virginia.gov/newsroom/all-releases/2021/december/headline-916534-en.html>

- The Northam Administration did a lot to improve Early Childhood Care and Education in Virginia. This included large budgetary investments in public Pre-K.
- In 2021, there was an increase in the Child Care Subsidy Program and it’s been extended through May, 2022.

4. Gill, Dee. “Head Start, the Public Preschool Program, More Than Pays for Itself.” UCLA Anderson Review, 19 May 2021,

<https://anderson-review.ucla.edu/head-start-the-public-preschool-program-more-than-pays-for-itself>

- This article describes a large study that was done to assess the long-term effects of Head Start. The study found that Head Start improved the chances that children would be self-sufficient financially in adulthood.
- There have been studies done on Head Start but this study stands out because it covered an exceptionally large group. The original goals of Head Start were to reduce poverty and increase children’s opportunities and this study shows that those goals have been largely achieved.

5. Stevens, Katharine B. and Matt Weidinger. “Improving Early Childhood Development by Allowing Advanced Child Tax Credits.” *American Enterprise Institute*. April 2021,

<https://www.aei.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/04/Improving-Early-Childhood-Development-by-Allowing-Advanced-Child-Tax-Credits.pdf?x91208>

- This article begins with the problem that so many children are in low quality child care, despite the fact that research has shown that young children should be in high quality, supportive environments. It asserts that current government subsidies aren't enough to help many low income and middle income families access quality child care, nor does current government financial support help families who prefer to care for their children at home.
- The article proposes policy that would allow parents to advance future child tax credits into the earliest years of their child's life, which would give families more money during their children's youngest years.

6. Brown, Patrick, "Child Care Pluralism: Supporting Working Families in Their Full Diversity, Niskanen Center, 17 June 2021,

<https://www.niskanencenter.org/child-care-pluralism-supporting-working-families-in-their-full-diversity/>

- This article challenges the notion that there is just one model of child care that Americans families want. It acknowledges the variety of values and needs in the United States, including single mothers who need to work full time, two parent families where both parents want to work full time, two parent families who want one parent to be at home full time and families who want part time work options.
- The article suggests that child care policy should not be focused on heavily-regulated top-down federally run child care but rather on creating a system whereby community institutions are empowered to offer child care at the local level. It also suggests that we should create tax codes that support families with children.

7. Miller, Claire Cain. "How other Nations Pay for Child Care. The U.S. an Outlier in Child Care". *The New York Times*, 6 Oct. 2021, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/10/06/upshot/child-care-biden.html>.

- This article offers facts about the amount of money the U.S. spends on child care and how the U.S. compares to other countries in the developed world. It also describes democrats' proposals for increased federal support for child care.
- The U.S. spends 0.2% of its GDP on child care for children 2 and younger. The other countries in the Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development spend an average of 0.7% of their GDP on toddlers, mainly through heavily subsidized child care.
- Overall, federal, state and local governments spend about \$1,000 a year on care for low income children ages 2 and younger and \$200 on other toddlers.

- For children under 3, only the poorest working families qualify for subsidies, through Early Head Start or the child care block grant, but fewer than 1 in 6 eligible children receive the help. For most families, the only direct government support for early care and education comes from the child and dependent care tax credit. It benefits higher earners most: The average credit is \$586, and \$124 for the lowest earners. (p1-2)

8. Early Childhood Engagement; Focusing on the Early Years. The Hunt Institute. 2022, <https://hunt-institute.org/programs/early-childhood-engagement/>

- Provided here is an excellent state by state analysis of early childhood care and education. Annually, The Hunt Institute updates its state early childhood “data landscapes”. The data is collected from a variety of sources and includes early childhood demographics, program access and program quality.

9. Alliance for Early Success. “Advancing Agendas and Routing Relief. The Alliance for Early Success Progress Report on Early Childhood Policy.” *Alliance for Early Success*, Oct. 2021, <https://earlysuccess.org/50stateprogressreport>.

This report, compiled by an organization that supports collaborative efforts to improve policy that benefits young children, offers statistics that include all of the states, as well as a state by state analysis. During 2020-21, each state had to address their state’s pandemic response while also continuing to pursue former policy goals. Themes from this report include the importance of collaboration, community and diversity.

- In 2021, states achieved 472 distinct state-level legislative or administrative policy wins. They continued the growing national emphasis on child care and infant health.
- A few highlights from individual states include:
- Alabama, which was featured in the documentary “Starting at Zero” has focused a lot recently on their QRIS (Quality Rating and Improvement system).
- Georgia has a task force for infant and toddler social and emotional health.
- North Carolina made progress with improvement of maternal health and maternal home visiting, as well as increasing wages for child care educators.
- California passed a bill that has a plan to reduce by at least half racial disparities in childhood chronic diseases by 2030.
- Virginia accomplished a lot for child care under the Northam administration and also passed a bill and budget initiatives that will help improve maternal health and prenatal health care benefits, particularly for women of color.

10. Hurley, Kendra. "The Lesser-Known Effort to Help Fix Child Care and Pay Teachers More." *Early Learning Nation*, 8 Feb. 2022, <https://earlylearningnation.com/2022/02/the-lesser-known-effort-to-help-fix-child-care-and-pay-teachers-more/>

- This article focuses on a new policy that D.C., New Mexico and Louisiana have put in place, that pays for subsidized child care based on what care costs instead of what parents currently pay. The amount that parents currently pay does not represent the true cost of child care.
- This new policy will significantly improve the earnings of early education teachers. According to the article, currently more than half of the nation's child care workers rely on public assistance.

PARENTS

Every generation of parents needs information and support for parenting. Indeed, it does "take a village" to raise a child. Parents who have fewer resources and less support may need more help implementing positive approaches to parenting young children and understanding children's developmental needs.

A recent PBS series highlighted problems parents have nation-wide, as they face the challenges of parenting, working and finding quality child care.

11. "Raising the Future: The Child Care Crisis." YouTube, uploaded by PBS NewsHour, 12 October 2021, <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=RydqJ1j3E-M>

- This series focuses on the fact that the lack of affordable, quality child care is a nation-wide problem in the U.S. It covers many aspects of the problem, including the history of child care in the U.S., different ideological views of what public policy should do, what constitutes quality child care and it also provides an in depth look at the challenges working parents face.
- Parents are interviewed and several programs that are helping working parents are featured, including a program that helps single mothers develop job skills and offers child care at the same time. The U.S military child care program is featured as a successful model for parents and children.

12. Jason DeParle. "When Child Care Costs Twice as Much as the Mortgage". *The New York Times*, 9 Oct. 2021, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/10/09/us/politics/child-care-costs-wages-legislation.html>

- This article begins by saying that its purpose is to help give information about why democrats want a government plan for increasing financial support for child care. It describes in detail the economic situation of parents in a small southern city as they pay for child care. It uses

examples of parents and describes each family's situation. The high cost of child care is demonstrated by the fact that child care can cost twice the mortgage for some families.

13. Wang, Wendy, and Jenet Erickson. "Homeward Bound: The Work-Family Reset in Post-Covid America." *Institute for Family Studies*, Aug. 2021,
<https://ifstudies.org/ifstudies-admin/resources/final-ifsparentsreport.pdf>

- This article describes the results of a survey that was done to assess parents' thoughts with regard to being home more with their children during the pandemic.
- The survey found that more than half of parents, mothers and fathers, with children under age 18, said that COVID-19 has made them more likely to prefer working from home, at least part time.
- The survey also asked parents about what type of child care they preferred and it found that care in child care centers was one of their least favorite choices, with flexible work schedules and shared child care one of their favorite choices.
- The authors conclude that in the future, parents may decide to choose where and when they want to work so they can provide the kind of child care they want.

CHILD CARE PROVIDERS

Early childhood care and education varies greatly from center to center. Quality programs are those that meet health and safety standards, provide for the social/emotional needs of children and include play and learning experiences. Quality programs are often the result of a natural process whereby competent adults create warm, joyful learning environments.

In the field of Early Childhood Care and Education, it is recognized that programs lacking in quality do not lead states to their goals for children. Quality needs to be proven, in order to get support from legislators. Additionally, there are technical methods for creating quality programs, including standards for learning, training for educators, coaching for educators and using various methods and tools designed for programs for young children.

Virginia has recently been working to improve the quality of its early childhood care and education. On July 1, 2021, everything involving child care policy was consolidated into the Department of Education. This was considered to be a big step forward for Early Childhood Care and Education.

In Virginia, there are also plans to improve child care health and safety regulations in the next few years. There still are different views of child care regulation. Some oppose more stringent regulations that could potentially put child care cooperatives or small church preschools out of business. Some, like the Virginia Montessori Association, do not want new regulations to interfere with their unique methods of education. Most however, see improved regulations as progress towards safer and more quality child care.

Child care educators should be acknowledged for the important role they play in society. They should be better compensated financially for what they do. This would include at least a living wage as well as benefits, such as paid leave and health insurance. One goal is for them to get the same compensation as K-12 teachers and assistants. This could also help improve the high turnover rate.

There should be education and ongoing training for all people who work in child care, including directors, teachers and assistants. This should include training about the business aspects of child care.

There is a need for equity for those who work in child care. It should be recognized that women, especially women of color, make up much of the child care workforce. Those who work with infants and toddlers have the lowest pay.

Staffing problems are being acknowledged as one of the biggest challenges in child care currently. We must remember that a child care workforce is a crucial aspect of child care.

While addressing the problems, it's also important to acknowledge the hard work, generosity, creativity and love that those who care for young children demonstrate every day.

14. Masters, Kate. "Virginia is Changing Expectations for Child Care Providers to put Focus on Early Education." *Virginia Mercury*, 18 June 2021,
<https://www.virginiamercury.com/2021/06/18/virginia-is-changing-expectations-for-child-care-providers-to-put-focus-on-early-education/>

- This article addresses the reasons for consolidating everything in the Department of Education and the plans for improvement in the near future.
- The child care system in Virginia had been fragmented. Additionally, when safety standards and inspections were done through the Department of Social Services the focus was on what was wrong.
- Now the approach will be more educational, with an emphasis on helping programs improve. A big challenge that remains is attracting more people to become child care educators.

15. Child Care Aware of America. "The Child Care Supply Crisis: Why Deregulation is not the Answer." *Child Care Aware of America*, 2019,
www.childcareaware.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/05/Deregulation-One-Pager-jan-2020.pdf

- States are trying to resolve the problem of a decline in the number of child care providers. The decline has been especially in home child care. Some states point to increased amounts of regulations as a major contributing factor to the decrease in providers but there is little evidence to support this.

- Regulations help ensure that children are in safe, quality environments. Instead of deregulation, providers need much more support and states should invest in programs that support the child care workforce.

16. “Power to the Profession”. *naeyc*, National Association for the Education of Young Children,
<https://www.naeyc.org/our-work/initiatives/profession>

- The National Association for the Education of Young Children, (NAEYC), is a respected and established organization. This describes, “Power to the Profession”, a program that the NAEYC developed. It consists of a unified viewpoint of the early childhood education profession.
- That includes many aspects of the profession, such as defining educator roles and responsibilities, professional development and compensation. Educators themselves developed the framework and it would improve equity for the early childhood workforce. If advanced, they believe it will empower early childhood educators.

17. Weil, Julie Zauzmer. “D.C. Government will send \$10,000 checks to the city’s day-care workers.”
The Washington Post, 1 Feb. 2022,
<https://www.washingtonpost.com/dc-md-va/2022/02/01/childcare-workers-checks-dc-council/>

- This article is about a policy solution to a big problem in child care, which is the fact that those who work in child care are so underpaid.
- It says that the Washington, D.C. City Council increased the salaries of child care workers by using a portion of the revenue they received when they raised taxes on the city’s highest income residents.

18. “Training and Professional Development”. *Virginia Department of Education, Child Care, VA*,
Commonwealth of Virginia, 2021, <https://www.doe.virginia.gov/cc/providers/index.html?pageID=5>

- The Virginia Department of Education is a resource that connects child care educators to many training opportunities throughout the state. It also offers basic online courses, right on its website. For example, on the website, educators can access the Virginia Preservice Training for Child Care Staff – Virginia’s Health and Safety Training Course, a ten hour training which is required for anyone working in a licensed center.

19. “Early Education”. *Virginia G3, Virginia G3, 2022*,
<https://viriniag3.com/programs/early-education/>

- This is about a program offered by the G3 fund, which was established in 2021, by a bill that passed the General Assembly, which amended the code of Virginia to create in the state treasury a special fund, known as Get Skilled, Get a Job, Give Back, G3.
- The program addresses Virginia’s need for qualified, skilled early childhood educators. G3 offers tuition assistance for Early Childhood Education programs at community colleges.

YOUNG CHILDREN

Most people now agree that what is best for children is what should drive public policy for children. As stated above, quality care is crucial.

High quality child care is nurturing and appropriately stimulating. It allows for socialization and independence. Low quality child care is often neglectful and sometimes abusive.

Whether a child is cared for by his/her parents, extended family, or in a child care home or a center, extensive research has shown that the quality of care a child receives during the first years of life has a large influence on that child’s outcomes later in life. While healthy attachment and a trauma free infancy and early childhood are not the specific focus of this study, it would be remiss for this study not to acknowledge this topic.

16. *Through the Night*. Directed and Produced by Loira Limbal, 2020,
<https://www.throughthenightfilm.com/>

- The documentary, “Through the Night”, follows the life of a home child care provider and the excellent child care she offers to children, during day and night. It also follows the stories of two working mothers who have their children in her child care home, and the many challenges they face in the workforce. It was filmed shortly before the pandemic. Women of color are featured in the film.
- It’s an example of child care that addresses the needs of families – their various work schedules as well as their social/emotional/cultural needs.

17. **Cherry, Kendra. “What is Attachment Theory.”** *Dotdash Media, Inc*, 17 July 2019,
<https://www.verywellmind.com/what-is-attachment-theory-2795337>

- This article describes the history of Attachment Theory, which established that the early bonds between children and their caregivers have a tremendous impact throughout life. The relevant theme of Attachment Theory is that primary caregivers who are available and responsive to an infant’s needs create a sense of security for the infant.

- From the secure base, children can then go on and explore the world. Research also shows that failure to form secure attachments in infancy has a negative impact on behavior throughout life.

18. Klein, Tovah P. MD. *How Toddlers Thrive*. New York, Simon & Schuster, Inc., 2014, <http://howtoddlersthrive.com/>

- This book addresses the importance of the toddler years for achieving positive outcomes later in life, including not only intelligence but also other traits such as self-regulation and empathy. The author/researcher describes the connection between toddlers' brain development and their behavior. Suggestions are given for how to respond to toddlers in different situations, to ensure positive attention and guidance.

19. *Starting at Zero – Reimagining Education in America*. Directed by Willa Kammerer, Executive Producer Alan H. Hammerman, 2020, <https://startingatzerofilm.com/>

- This documentary is about Alabama's excellent early childhood care and education programs. Specifically, their pre-K program is a model for other states. It was created based on research and has proven itself to be a quality program. The program is free for eligible students and their families.
- The film also addresses the importance of developing quality pre-K programs throughout the United States. Several governors are featured and they talk about how they are starting to prioritize early childhood education as a way to improve their economy, improve educational outcomes and support families.

20. *First 10 All Children Learn and Thrive*, Education Development Center, <https://first10.org/>

- The First 10 program is based on the fact that research shows the importance of the first 10 years of life and that when you invest in the early years, you get results.
- These programs begin in local areas of need and they start small and then grow. They focus on all aspects of child development and they provide education and support for parents. They emphasize connections between the community and the schools. This includes social services and early childhood care partnerships.

21. Chapdelaine, Rachel. "Virginia Preschool Initiative Plus Significantly Impacts School Community." *University of Virginia School of Education and Human Development*, 11 Oct. 2019, <https://education.virginia.edu/news/virginia-preschool-initiative-plus-significantly-impacts-school-community>

- This article is about the Virginia Preschool Initiative program, which was established to increase access to high-quality preschool for Virginia’s most vulnerable children.
- An evaluation of the program showed that it produced significant improvements for children. Areas of improvement included math skills, literacy skills, good relationships between teachers and children and partnerships with families.

SCHOOL AGED CHILDREN

After school programs are an important part of the bigger picture of child care. Many public and private schools have after school care and other programs are available as well.

22. “Boys and Girls Clubs of America – Providing Millions of Kids and Teens a Safe Place to Develop Essential Skills, Make Lasting Connections and Have Fun.” *Boys and Girls Clubs of America – Providing Millions of Kids and Teens a Safe Place to Develop Essential Skills, Make Lasting Connections and Have Fun.*, <https://www.bgca.org/>

- Nationally, Boys and Girls Clubs provide much needed after school programs for school age children. This website describes the kinds of activities Boys and Girls Clubs provide. After-school programs are not the only kind of program they provide. They have a long and admirable history, as they began in 1860 and continue to serve large numbers of children.
- Their mission is: “To enable all young people, especially those who need us most, to reach their full potential as productive, caring, responsible citizens”.

23. “Afterschool Enrichment Program”. *The Child Care and Learning Center*, The Child Care and Learning Center. 2020, <https://www.rappcclc.org/afterschool-enrichment-program>

- This is a description of the afterschool program at a child care center in rural Rappahannock County, Virginia, that is known for its excellence. The program is for children who are 5 to 12 years of age and attend another school during the day. During the program, the children have a snack, free play, nature activities, other small group activities and homework time. Also of note is that public school buses provide transportation to the program and tuition assistance is available.

CONCLUSION

Taking on a study of child care is to take on a complex problem.

Whereas, before the pandemic, there was already acknowledgement of the need for more child care, now the discussion has really expanded to emphasize the effects that a lack of child care is having on the U.S. workforce.

Questions remain about whether government should support all children or primarily children from lower income families and children with disabilities. Questions also remain about whether government investment should be in the form of financial assistance given directly to families or in the form of government run child care programs.

When government does invest in child care, it's important to ensure that government investments produce good results.

In summary, key themes are that we need a child care system that is more accessible, equitable and affordable, that programs should include health, safety play and education and that child care providers need more training opportunities and living wages.